

MUSIC 662, Introduction to Research in Music (Fall 2009)

Prof. Steve Gerber

Written assignment to submit on November 12

#8, JOURNAL ARTICLE CRITIQUES B – Music Education (8 points)

Read any two of the four articles listed below, and write a critique (4-6 pages total) that, first, briefly **summarizes each article**, and then proceeds to **compare and evaluate** the pair as more-or-less effective presentations of research (the larger portion of the essay). As in the earlier critical essay assignment (“Critiques A”), include **at least six** properly-formatted footnotes: two (or more) to one of the articles, two (or more) to the other, and two (or more) to additional sources. Keep the following items in mind as you discuss and compare your selected authors’ treatments of their subjects; be prepared for class discussion.

Type of research materials used: to what extent do the authors use primary sources (data collected from original research) and secondary sources (prior studies on similar topics); to what degree are the studies quantitative vs. qualitative; do you have other observations on the amount, quality, or relevance of data?

Purpose for which research materials are used: do the authors present a previously unknown set of facts to clarify and enrich our understanding; or, do they provide evidence to dispute someone’s previous claim; or, do they re-interpret received knowledge in a novel way; or, do they prescribe some kind of change in doing or thinking? In any case, is the supporting material used effectively? If illustrations, tables, graphs, or musical examples are used, are they essential, or if not used, is their absence detrimental? Is the amount of research cited appropriate, or should there be more, or less?

Presentation of ideas: does each author clearly define or identify the article’s thesis near the beginning and then proceed logically to establish it? Does he or she helpfully “forecast” the article’s structure or argumentation in the opening section, and is the structure clear and easy to outline, with section headings or other markers to facilitate readerly navigation? Do the paragraphs and sections flow well from point to point? How difficult is the material to understand—how much specialized knowledge (especially familiarity with statistics) is presumed in the reader?

Bergee, Martin J. and Melvin C. Platt. "Influence of Selected Variables on Solo and Small-Ensemble Festival Ratings." *Journal of Research in Music Education* 51, no. 4 (Winter 2003): 342-353.

Guilbault, Denise-Marie. "The Effect of Harmonic Accompaniment on the Tonal Achievement and Tonal Improvisations of Children in Kindergarten and First Grade." *Journal of Research in Music Education* 52, no. 1 (Spring 2004): 64-76.

King, Elaine C. "The Roles of Student Musicians in Quartet Rehearsals." *Psychology of Music* 34, no. 2 (April 2006): 262-282.

Ogawa, Yoko and Tadahiro Murao. "The Acquisition Process of Children's Game Songs during Peer Teaching: A Semi-structured Experiment with Pre-school Children." *Research Studies in Music Education* 29, no. 1 (December 2007): 69-78.