I. Introduction
   A. Culturally Responsive, Critical Pedagogy & Cultural Competence
      1. Definitions of each
      2. Theoretical Background for each and how they differ & are still very similar
   B. Briefly discuss why looking at in-service teacher practice around the above theories looking at:
      What made the teachers successful?
      What impact their practice had on students?
      Were there extraordinary results for particular students (minority children or children with disabilities)? Why?
   C. Introduce the idea of convergence of the research
      • the need to find the links between practice and theory
      • Do these articles provide that? How? And why?
      • What is the need/benefit of convergent evidence?

Annotations:

The authors provide a through socio-historical and political perspective of bilingual education and education reform, plus a timeline to understanding current policy and political actions towards minority student but more specifically to Latino students. Critical pedagogy, questioning social realities, investigating new ways to look at the issues surrounding the educational practices and policies towards Latino students, through this framework educators, researchers, and teacher training programs can begin to provide ‘educational justice’ for all students. Strong, refreshing wording, the authors are extremely clear on what they are proposing and why it is essential.

**Convergent Evidence Article**

Will use this article to introduce and discuss the need for convergent evidence in educational research. The purpose of this paper is to demonstrate how convergent evidence can strengthen and provide a clear understanding of how teachers encourage the development of a critical conscious in students. Through a “convergent evidence” framework it will be possible to articulate how and what each of these teachers did how were they similar and how did they differ from each other.
III. In-Service Teacher Practices

A. Activities used to establish a culturally responsive classroom environment
B. Student response to the activities
C. Reflection by the teachers on their own practice. What makes them successful?
D. How did teachers know what to do?

Annotations:


Introduction has an excellent history and definitions of bilingual education. Utilizes qualitative participatory research model, which allows the research to be co-constructed and provide for personal narrative and voice to be formed through the project. Participants were five Spanish bilingual teachers in the beginning of their careers, each were in various school and various types of bilingual programs. This article relates to the articles in that it discusses the practices these ‘critically conscious’ and social justice educators instilled in their teaching and how they communicated their theoretical/cultural beliefs to their students. In the project a collaborative relationship was formed between the five teachers and the university researcher.


Four novice teachers were selected in an urban elementary school. Video and audio tapes were analyzed to investigate what made these teachers effective in working with CLAD students. The first two hours of the first day and interviews after the completion of the first day of school where the data sources. This article provided a conceptual framework that incorporated elements of culturally responsive, resiliency, and care theories in order to demonstrate what, how and why these four teachers were successful in engaging all learners in their classrooms. The first two hours were viewed as a pivotal time due to the fact that this was a time when the teacher established a respectful community environment where everyone’s skills/knowledge was acknowledged. Through the videotapes, audio recordings, and the interviews the researchers were able to surmise that every moment of those first two hours (actually the entire first day) were very purposeful. The teachers reflected on what had gone well and what they needed to go back and strengthen and why. Four themes were explained and examples provided. The themes where: developing relationships, establishing expectations, insistence: holding students accountable for meeting expectations, and communicating in culturally responsive ways.


This was a qualitative study consisting of extensive interviews with 13 practicing teachers at various stages in their careers, all in urban public schools. The research does a great job of showing how the participant responses correlate to culturally responsive theory and previous research. Through the data and theoretical analyzes the author provides a framework for the qualities/attitudes urban educators must embrace in order to be successful.

Wow. I realize that this was research done with high school students but it was such a powerful article, I have begun to think about how it might work with younger students. I see this article as a wonderful example of how pedagogy can make a difference! As I am continuously bombarded and upset about what is happening all around us (Northern Virginia), I found hope in this article. It illustrated how purposeful, reflective, critical practice can empower students, even ones that have been disenfranchised for their entire educational career. What would happen if we changed the education paradigm and began to encourage the type of teaching proposed by Cammarota and Romero instead of perpetuating xenophobic ideologies, assimilation mentalities based on white/Anglo teaching models? As students’ realities change educators must begin to see new ways of reaching students.


Three 2nd grade classrooms in various settings were the data collection sites. Intervention study, it was conducted in a very short time frame, each teacher only used one book (More Than Anything Else). Researchers and teachers used Text Talk intervention with a more culturally responsive framework in order to encourage critical dialogue in the classrooms. Provides possibilities on how to start thinking about how critical thinking and culturally responsive practices can be integrated in to the classroom. Would have been more validate had it had more books and conducted over a longer period of time. Teachers did use KWLs as a way to assess students’ knowledge prior to beginning the unit.


This article represents a small subset of a much larger year long study with parents of children in the public school who were enrolled in GED programs (10 families each interviewed 4 times over the course of the year). Both adults and children were interviewed, teachers of the children, in addition field notes and observations were used. (constant comparative method and categorical analysis). Discussion of the literacy practices of the two families comes in direct contradiction to school literacy practices and is therefore not valued or even seen as existing. What is valued and celebrated at home is never respected or valued for it is not even in the worldview of the school or teachers. The observation by Compton-Lilly that the school was completely oblivious to the realities of violence and poverty in their own backyard stands as direct proof of the realities of continued un-multicultural and un-culturally un-responsive pedagogies. It demonstrates the lasting implications of this lack of awareness of students’ cultures and families and the obvious stereotypical, uninformed and oppressive attitude towards culturally, linguistically and ability diverse (CLAD) students. Yet one has to ask are Angel and Aralon’s teachers the exception or the rule? The consequences of this lack of cultural understanding was enormous for Angel becomes labeled, neither child is supported in reaching their full potential. For as Compton-Lilly insightfully observes “Angel’s reading strengths were
obscured by his school behaviors and the assumptions about his family, whereas Aralon’s lack of progress in reading was not acknowledged in the wake of her cheerful attitude and academic disposition (93).”


“La Maestra Miriam” demonstrates several key points: teacher knowledge, teacher expectations, willingness to supplement curriculum, student motivation, student abilities, student “funds of knowledge”, and the benefits of bi-lingual education and the teacher’s role in forming communications between school knowledge and home knowledge. The article provides examples of student work and reflective classroom conversations. In addition, “La Maestra Miriam” was interviewed to further understand her philosophy. She provides extremely insightful statements about her practice, motivation, personal experience, and perceptions of her students’ abilities to succeed. “Of course, I have to know them to have an idea about what they understand. I share about my life and I make time for them to share with me and each other, in both formal and informal ways throughout the day. When they talk about something they know, like their [life] experiences, they use a lot more language, which helps them to become more literate and more confident (excerpt from interview).” Her high standards and expectations clearly demonstrated how she did not prescribe to the dominant social discourse of Spanish speaking students as less than. “La Maestra Miriam” provides a theoretically based examination into how a critically reflective pedagogue interacts and defines her classroom community. The entire analysis is framed within the context of discursive socio-political environment that exists for language minority children.


The research shows that it is possible for a teacher to connect and teach children that very different from him/her. Through case study design Gillanders investigates how the teacher is able to form relationships and engage CLAD students in her class. In addition Gillanders conducted interviews with the parents in order to hear their voices and opinions into how they perceive the teacher and her practices. Triangulation of the data was used in order provide validity to the results. Gillanders identified three key components to the teacher’s success: enhancing relationship, using Spanish, and playing together. In addition to these themes it was stated that “Teachers who are sensitive to children’s emotional needs might be able to transcend the language barriers and create social environments in which these children are accepted by their peers and have more opportunities to become full participants in the community of the classroom without losing their native language [or cultural identity] (52).” Plus the fact that “predictable” routines and classroom structure helped to create environments that helped build the student-teacher and student-student relationships. Learning was able to happen for all children but especially for CLAD students because there was an enormous amount of stability.

The bases of Funds of Knowledge is grounded in the idea of looking at students’ realities as rich learning environments, even though they may differ from what we (as White middle class teachers) value. Moll and Gonzalez emphasize the need to recognize authentic literacy environments second language learners are a part of everyday. They encourage and demonstrate that it is possible “be with the people and from the people”. In this particular article they outline the project design, findings and implications. A key layer of the project design that differs from any other of the research articles used here is the professor-inservice teacher collaboration and the fact that the professional development was conducted over time with reflection and self-analysis at every point.


Elementary teacher investigates ‘renaming’ incident with a student in her classroom. Thought the case study she walks the reader through how she engaged the family (home visits) and integrated the child’s socio-cultural understanding of the world into her teaching and understanding of why the family chose to change the child’s name. Investigates assimilation activities that immigrant (especially Mexican-American) families engage in and how these practices impact the formation of a health cultural identity for minority students. She reflects on her own schooling experiences and her own efforts to ‘rename’ herself (due to the difficulty of her name). Through her interactions with the family, student, and her own reflection on her past experiences she is able to expose the child’s voice. His experience and the fact that he became literally lost the first day of school because he did not know he had a ‘new’ name, is extremely powerful. The narratives and stories about “Tommy” provide powerful examples of how young children understand, articulate, and flat out refuse the enormous impact assimilation powers have. This enabled her to connect to her student in a very authentic understanding way. The article offers a look into the assimilation experience of minorities in American culture.


Participants are two African American female teachers in a large urban area, one teacher is late in her career and the other is very early on. The article utilizes the two case studies as a way to demonstrate and validate theories around education practices that are beneficial to African American students. Classroom observations and interviews were the data sources. Outlines the key characteristics of a successful African American educator, and then demonstrate how each teacher practices the characteristic and how each articulates a particular practice. Each teacher provided a caring, loving, supportive classroom environment where she communicated clear, consistent expectations.
IV. Analysis of Research
   A. Convergent Evidence
      a. Themes and commonalities between
         i. Theories
         ii. In Service Practice
      b. Strengths
   B. Divergent Evidence
      a. Contradictions
      b. Limitations

IV. Conclusion
   A. Reflection
      1. Where to go from here?
      2. What do these findings tell us?
      3. How does this connect to the research being done on teacher preparation programs that incorporate culturally responsive theory into their programs? Are they doing what the research says needs to be done in order for the teacher to be successful?
      4. Where are there gaps in research/in my own thinking or understanding?